Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital
An International Design/Development Competition

INVITATION FOR SUBMISSIONS

Kaleida Health
Buffalo, NY
This document was prepared by the Urban Design Project, School of Architecture and Planning, University at Buffalo, State University of New York with assistance from Cassidy Turley.
Table of contents

Statement of community values.................................................................4
Introduction...............................................................................................5
An extraordinary site................................................................................5
Sponsor intentions.....................................................................................7
An open competition................................................................................7
The property.............................................................................................8
Competition guidelines...........................................................................9
The jury.....................................................................................................10
Selection criteria......................................................................................11
Submittal requirements..........................................................................12
Other competition requirements..........................................................14
Special conditions..................................................................................15
Statement of Community Values

The redevelopment of the Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital property must support the fulfillment of Kaleida Health’s core mission to deliver quality health care to the city and region. The redevelopment must also be guided by expressed community values addressing the impact of a project on the surrounding neighborhoods, the city at-large, and the whole region.

The entity selected to redevelop the Millard Fillmore Gates Circle property should respect and share the community’s values. The community supports a process and a project that will:

- Be informed by an open and inclusive community conversation supported by accessible and reliable information about the choices Kaleida Health and the eventual redeveloper must make.
- Contribute to the character and quality of life of the surrounding neighborhoods, the city at-large, and the broader region and minimize negative impacts such as parking, traffic, and other nuisances.
- Provide benefits through the improvement of the urban environment that accrue equitably to neighborhoods on all sides of the property.
- Result in a development that is sustainable in the fullest sense of the term – economic, social, and environmental.
- Respect the value of the special urban context of the site including the Olmsted parks and parkways system as well as the surrounding neighborhoods.
- Manifest a quality of design excellence appropriate to – and adding value to – one of the most important and prominent sites in the city.
- Minimize, as far as possible with a large property, the total time from closure of the hospital to the productive reuse of the property.

This statement of community values was adopted by the Project Advisory Committee for the reuse of Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital. The committee encompasses a broad cross-section of community members including representatives of neighborhood organizations, professions, businesses, institutions, and local government.
Introduction

Kaleida Health is offering a $1 million prize to the developer/designer team submitting a winning proposal for redevelopment of its historic Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital in Buffalo, NY.

The competition will be judged by an eight-member jury comprising internationally-recognized architects, urban designers, and real estate developers as well as respected members of the Buffalo Niagara regional community.

Kaleida Health is mounting this competition as a way to generate developer and designer interest in this unusual, challenging, but potentially very profitable real estate opportunity — and to designate a developer to do the project.

As of April 2012 Kaleida Health will cease operations at the historic Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital as it moves clinical care to the new Gates Vascular Institute on the Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus.

This is a huge step forward in improving the quality, accessibility, and efficiency of health care in the Buffalo Niagara region. At the same time, it presents a moment of uncertainty about the future of the current facility, the neighborhoods surrounding it, the Olmsted Parkway on which it sits, and for the whole city and region.

Kaleida Health is committed to a future for this property that resolves this uncertainty as quickly as possible, even as it protects and promotes the values and interests of our community, and meets Kaleida Health’s obligations for prudent stewardship of all of its assets.

An extraordinary site

The property has extraordinary adjacencies and proximities.

It sits on Gates Circle, the terminus of Frederick Law Olmsted’s Chapin Parkway connecting to Olmsted’s Delaware Park and the rest of his path-breaking city-wide system of parks and parkways.

It is a ten minute drive or less from Downtown Buffalo to the south and the University at Buffalo Main Street campus to the north.

It is a five minute drive or less from Canisius College, Buffalo State College, the Albright Knox Art Gallery, the high-end Elmwood Avenue shopping district, most of Buffalo’s grandest homes, one of its best neighborhoods, its historic Allentown district, and Buffalo’s Main Street transit line.

Most importantly, perhaps, it is less than two miles from the Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus, a concentration of clinical, academic, research, and commercialization activity in health care planned to grow by more than 10,000 employees over the coming decade.

The economic struggles of the Buffalo Niagara region are famous. What is less well known is that the city and region missed the housing “bubble.” Property values continue to appreciate. Income growth is strong. And the region has seen an influx of young people with advanced degrees in recent years.

In brief, Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital offers a redevelopment opportunity in the “sweet spot” of a surprisingly resurgent Buffalo real estate market.
Figure 2. From top to bottom: (Top left) Looking northwest from Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital to Chapin Parkway and beyond, (Top right) Elmwood Village shops, Albright Knox Art Gallery, Historic Allentown District, The Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus.
**Sponsor intentions**

The owner’s interests are clear and simple. Kaleida Health is a healthcare provider, not a real estate developer. Kaleida Health would like to transfer this property to a creative, responsible, high-quality redeveloper as soon as possible.

Kaleida Health’s goal is to identify a developer or development team that has the creativity, desire, expertise and financial capability to prepare and implement a comprehensive redevelopment strategy for the Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital complex. In the process, the developer must be willing to work with Kaleida Health, collaborate with residents of adjacent communities, and tailor planning and design to the historic character of the Gates Circle area.

The developer must demonstrate experience and resources needed to design and develop a successful, sustainable, high-quality project. Prior experience in adaptive reuse of historic structures, including finance, construction, and experience and expertise in the use of incentive programs and other resources will be critical elements in evaluating both qualifications and proposals.

In the process, Kaleida Health would like to retain and augment the goodwill of the community by finding a developer who will respect the interests of our neighbors, both in the long-run and during the redevelopment process.

The community’s values are also clear (see statement on page 4). As expressed through a Project Advisory Committee formed late last year, the community desires an open and transparent process leading to new uses on the site that add value to the urban environment on all sides, exhibit excellence in design, are consistent with neighborhood context, respect the Olmsted legacy, manifest a robust concept of sustainability, and minimize the length of time the property is vacant.

**An open competition**

The International Design/Development Competition is an open process in at least two ways. First, it is open to any team comprising both development and design capacities sufficient to conceive, plan, design, finance, and construct a project of the magnitude suggested by the property description.

Second, the competition is open in terms of the redevelopment concept that might lead the winning entry. Competitors should propose the uses, space program, target markets, architectural image, and other elements that in their judgment are appropriate to the site, neighborhood context, real estate market, community values, and stakeholder aspirations.

Likewise, the competition presupposes no particular approach by competitors to demolition, adaptive reuse, and new construction or any combination thereof. The winning entry might propose demolition of the entire complex, or a mix of demolition and reuse, or the adaptive reuse of all the buildings in the complex.

Last year, Kaleida Health invited an advisory services panel from the Urban Land Institute (ULI) to help explore the redevelopment potential of the property. The recommendations of the panel were attractive to many, but they should not be interpreted as suggestion or instruction about the shape of a winning proposal in this competition. The panel’s report is included in the competition information.

Figure 3. Ground plan for reconfigured property produced by the 2011 ULI panel.
The property

Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital consists of 11 distinguishable buildings on the roughly ten-acre site. Some of these buildings are historically significant while others are noncontributing. The facility had its origins in the Buffalo Homeopathic Hospital, originally located at Washington and North Division streets. In 1911, the hospital opened a new 121,000-square-foot facility at its current location at Lafayette and Linwood Avenues with its northwest corner on Gates Circle.

In 1923, its name changed to honor President Millard Fillmore, who was also founding chancellor of the University of Buffalo. The hospital has grown since 1923, making the following major additions, to reach its current configuration at 882,000 square feet.

- 1927: 50,000 square foot expansion and 40,000 square foot nurses’ home;
- 1941: 161,000 square foot, ten story Center Building;
- Mid-1950s: 139,000 square foot, ten story addition, new nurses’ home to match the first, and a new auditorium;
- 1964: 40,000 square foot kitchen and admissions building;
- 1973: 50,000 square foot power plant;
- 1974: 231,000 square foot medical services building housing intensivecare units and emergency department; and
- 1976: 760 car parking ramp built and owned by the city of Buffalo and operated under contract by Allpro Parking, LLC.

The Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital is located on approximately ten acres and includes all parcels highlighted in red and buildings highlighted in yellow in figure 5 on page 9. The hospital occupies a strategically important site in the urban fabric of Buffalo. It straddles the line between a stable, established, and highly desirable neighborhood to its north and west and a sometimes struggling neighborhood, now staging a comeback, just to its east. Even further to the east and on the opposite side of Main Street, some residential areas are even more severely challenged with many vacant homes and many empty lots.

The site also sits at the juncture between two important vehicular and visual corridors through the city. To the south is a section of Delaware Avenue, a major thoroughfare, which is flanked by mansions from Buffalo’s golden age and was once known as Millionaire’s Mile. A number of high rise apartment towers have been inserted into this fabric, but the fundamental grandeur of the streetscape remains.
To the northwest and connected to Gates Circle is Chapin Parkway – one leg in Frederick Law Olmsted’s great city-wide system of parks and parkways. And just north on Delaware Avenue is Forest Lawn Cemetery. Both connect ultimately to Olmsted’s Delaware Park – Buffalo’s central park. The Olmsted legacy, more than anything else, defines the character of the site and provides much of its value. Moreover, the obligation to Olmsted constrains and directs what might be done with the Millard Fillmore Gates Circle property. A fuller description of the property is available in the briefing book prepared for the ULI panel as well as in the ULI report itself. Both are attached for the information of competitors.

**Competition guidelines**

The sponsor offers a single prize of $1 million for the winning entry to be paid contingent upon the approval of the development proposal and closing on a property transfer agreement.

The competition will also award additional prizes of $40,000 for the runner up, $20,000 for third place, and $10,000 for one honorable mention. Competitors are expected to invest significant time and effort in their submissions. These prizes are intended to compensate entrants for that investment – even when their proposal is not deemed most meritorious.

In the event that none of the entrants submits an awardable project, or that a property transfer agreement and closing cannot be made, the prizes for second, third, and honorable mention will still be awarded but the $1 million first prize will not.

Submissions should include complete information on both the project proposal and the developer qualifications. Detailed submission requirements are outlined below.

All submissions must be received by 5 p.m. Friday, April 6, 2012. Contestants will provide the full submission package in a single 8½ x 11 inch bound document. Eight (8) hard copies are required as well as an electronic file on disc or “flash” drive.

Following a first round of reviews by the jury, finalists in the competition will be expected to present their proposals at a public exhibition in Buffalo. Members of the community will have an opportunity to view the proposals and offer their comments to the jury, which will subsequently make a final determination on the winners.
The jury

The jury consists of eight members who individually and collectively bring a wide range of expertise, experience, professional orientations, and community perspectives to the selection of the winning entry. The members of the jury are:

**Robert G. Shibley**, AICP, FAIA, Dean of the University at Buffalo School of Architecture and Planning, is the competition director. Shibley brings more than four decades experience in architecture, urban design, public process management, energy research, construction management, and more. He led the development of Buffalo’s current comprehensive plan and its component downtown, waterfront, and Olmsted parks plans.

**Maurice Cox**, (invited) Associate Professor of Architecture at the University of Virginia, is a nationally-noted urban designer and one-time Mayor of Charlottesville, VA. As Director of Design for the National Endowment for the Arts, Cox oversaw the Mayor’s Institute for City Design and other programs intended to strengthen the practice of urban design in the United States.

**Joseph Kessler**, Executive Vice President and Chief Financial Officer, Kaleida Health, brings more than 24 years of financial experience to healthcare management. He served 16 years with TriHealth, an integrated health system serving the greater Cincinnati area. Kessler is a member of the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants and the Healthcare Financial Management Association.

**Albert J. Kruger**, RPA, Director of Corporate Real Estate, Kaleida Health. Kruger serves as the senior real estate executive responsible for the administration, management and the delivery of real estate services across the system, including leasing, acquisition and dispositions, property management in support of Kaleida Health strategic initiatives.

**Janet Meiselman**, President, Oxford Consulting Inc., member of the Oxford Square Block Club, and a neighbor of the Gates Circle property for more than 25 years. Meiselman has nearly two decades experience in the development of affordable housing covering more than 40 projects and 850 units worth in excess of $100 million. She consults on development and financing of affordable housing for families, seniors and those with special needs.

**Tom Powers**, Executive Managing Director and Principal, Cassidy and Turley, real estate development consultants, Cincinnati, OH. Cassidy Turley is a comprehensive real estate services firm with 60 offices worldwide and nearly half a billion square feet of space under management. Powers has worked extensively with Kaleida Health on its real estate needs.

**Steven Spillman**, Principal at Pacifica Companies, consults on real estate investment and development, specializing in high density, urban mixed-use properties and projects including office, retail, multifamily, lodging, medical and industrial uses throughout the United States and internationally. Spillman was a member of the Urban Land Institute Advisory Services panel that created potential scenarios for the redevelopment of Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital in 2011.

**Edward “Ted” Walsh, Jr.** is President and Chief Operating Officer of Walsh Duffield Companies, Inc., insurance, a former chair of the Kaleida Health board of directors, and chair of the Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital re-use project advisory committee. Walsh serves on the board of directors of the John R. Oishei Foundation, the Josephine Goodyear Foundation, the Buffalo Niagara Partnership, and Great Lakes Health.
Selection criteria

Submissions will be evaluated on both the qualifications of the design/development team as well as the quality of the project proposal, its program, plan, design, financing, and feasibility.

Proposal characteristics

The jury will select a winning proposal based on the following criteria:

- The quality of the preliminary architectural design concept and approach to urban design;
- The extent to which they expect the project will be an asset to neighborhoods, city, and region, including the Olmsted Parks system;
- The degree to which the project and approach meet community expectations for improvement in the urban environment to be equitably shared;
- The extent to which the project meets contemporary expectations for sustainable development;
- The overall feasibility of the proposal in the context of prevailing market conditions, available financing, regulatory requirements, community attitudes, and the potential of the site itself.
- The likelihood of timely progress toward closing on a property transfer agreement leading to the positive redevelopment of the site.

Developer Characteristics

The jury will select a winning design/development team based on the following criteria:

- Overall track record in executing projects of the scale, type, and quality required at the Gates Circle site;
- Experience in projects in a redevelopment area and through public-private partnerships;
- Experience producing sustainable development projects including building reuse, energy conservation, and LEED criteria in general;
- Expertise in architecture and urban design, especially in adaptive reuse of historic structures, and construction of in-fill projects;
- Experience with innovative projects using creative site design concepts and maintaining a high quality development standard;
- Ability to secure project funding, including current relationships with major lenders and past funding experience with sustainable projects;
- Ability to provide sufficient equity to satisfy conventional lender requirements and assure timely implementation and completion of the project;
- Experience with financial incentive programs and resources available for sustainable or historic re-use projects;
- Experience in providing effective marketing, leasing, and property management;
- Overall demonstration that developer is ready, willing, and able to implement the project;
- Proposed purchase price for the property.

Figure 8. Neighborhood scale commercial development to the north of Gates Circle along Delaware Avenue.
Submittal Requirements

Responses to this competition invitation must include the following information in a brief and concise format. Kaleida Health reserves the right to request additional information during the evaluation of responses and to reject any or all proposals.

Developer or Developer Team Experience

Identify the primary developer and all members of the development team, including the project lead for day-to-day management of the project and consultants who will be responsible for implementing the project (name of individual, firm address, email address and telephone number). Provide a very concise narrative describing the role and relevant background experience of the individuals who would be involved in implementing the project, and addressing the availability of resources, experience, or capabilities to assure timely implementation of the project. Provide resumes of all development team members. Identify any development team experience with adaptive reuse of historic structures, sustainable projects, and/or projects in a redevelopment area.

Project Concept Summary

Provide a concise narrative summary of the project concept, (1 page maximum) including:

- General description of the proposed concept for the site;
- Financial details and proposed transaction terms to obtain the Site for development; and;
- Proposed development schedule.

Development Implementation Strategy

Provide a concise narrative explanation of how the development team will plan and implement the redevelopment of the site within the project description, including but not limited to:

- Description of how the development will use a creative and innovative site design and ownership structure to create a successful, high quality development;
- Budget estimates;
- Description of how the development team will successfully manage, operate, and maintain the project;
- Proposed development schedule, including, at a minimum, number of months after approval of the development and disposition agreement to:
  * Complete design;
  * Obtain permits;
  * Start construction; and
  * Complete construction.

Project Concept

Submit the following items to adequately portray the project concept:

- Site plan showing the entire block with existing structures, streets, sidewalks, and street trees, traffic flows and lanes.
- Drawings of principal elevations, including street sections and adjacent uses. Elevations should include overall vertical dimensions rendered to indicate principal materials; additional notes are welcome.
- Program summary tabulation, including: gross square foot (“GSF”) floor areas, parking spaces, parking ratios per unit/use, unit count and use categories by floor and totals, and total FAR; and
- List of structures anticipated to be renovated and/or demolished.
**Pro Forma**

Submit a financial pro forma detailed enough to show the overall structure of the financial package for the project and to demonstrate the overall financial feasibility of the project including key economic and financial assumptions such as land and construction costs, rental rates, sales projections, finance interest rates, and public tax credits, tax abatements, or other incentives.

**Statement of Qualifications**

Provide a concise narrative description of the following:

- Qualifications and experience that demonstrate the team’s ability to execute the proposed project concept;
- Experience and financial capability of the team to successfully plan, design, obtain approval and construct the proposed project concept;
- Team members’ recognized design accomplishments as they relate to sustainable design, adaptive reuse of historic structures, development within urban redevelopment/infill areas and/or under public/private partnerships; and
- Current relationships with lending institutions or other funding sources that would contribute to the feasibility of the proposed project concept.

**Developer Experience**

Provide a concise chart listing the development projects that are most comparable to the desired project that have been completed by the development team, including identification and a brief description of each project, street address, completed value, sources of financing, construction/completion time frames and dates, identification and role of the development team in the project. Include projects within urban redevelopment/infill areas, involving adaptive reuse of an historic structure, sustainable design principles, public/private partnerships and/or public coordination, and demonstrating experience with public and citizen involvement.

**Development Team References**

Provide development team references. Include a minimum of three professional references (lenders, investors, major accounts, etc.), with full names, relationship to team member, address, email address and telephone number.

**Equal Opportunity Strategy**

Kaleida is strongly committed to equal opportunity in the solicitation of business contracting to assure that persons or businesses doing business with or receiving funds from Kaleida are an equal opportunity business and employer. Kaleida endeavors to do business with firms sharing Kaleida’s commitment to equal opportunity and will not do business with any firm that discriminates. Kaleida strongly recommends that persons and businesses doing business with Kaleida take positive steps toward diversity and expand their subconsulting and subcontracting solicitation base and offer opportunities to all eligible persons or businesses.

*Figure 10.* The main tower of the hospital complex is considered by some to be too tall in relation to the neighborhood context.
Other competition requirements

□ Registration. Teams intending to submit responses are required to register by email to Bradshaw Hovey, project staff, at bhovey@buffalo.edu no later than March 1, 2012. Registrations should include a brief statement of interest, name of the firm, and information for a primary contact person.

□ Site visit and briefing. Competitors should plan to visit Buffalo to tour the property and receive a briefing by Kaleida Health and City of Buffalo officials. Dates to be arranged.

□ Submission deadline. All submissions must be received by 5 p.m. Friday, April 6, 2012 by Robert G. Shibley, Dean, School of Architecture and Planning, University at Buffalo, 114 Diefendorf Hall, Buffalo, NY 14214. Finalists will be notified by April 16, 2012.

□ Submission specifications. Contestants will provide the full submission package in a single 8½ x 11 inch bound document. Eight (8) hard copies are required as well as an electronic file on disc or “flash” drive.

□ Exhibition requirements. Competitors who are named finalists will be expected to come to Buffalo for a public exhibition and review. Finalist teams will be required to prepare three 24 x 36 inch boards describing and illustrating their full proposal. These boards will be mounted at the exhibition along with those of the other finalists. Visitors to the exhibition will be offered the opportunity to provide comment to the jury.

□ Questions. Inquiries regarding the submission procedures, about the competition invitation, or about the property should be submitted to Bradshaw Hovey via e-mail at bhovey@buffalo.edu. Answers to questions will be shared on a continuing basis with all registered entrants by e-mail.

Special conditions

□ This invitation for submissions does not commit Kaleida Health or any other entity affiliated with the competition to award a prize if the jury or the management of Kaleida Health deem the requirements of the competition have not been met.

□ All information submitted in response to this invitation shall become the property of Kaleida Health and may be used by the sponsor in any manner.

□ Kaleida Health has ultimate sole discretion and reserves the right to reject any and all submissions received with respect to this invitation and to cancel the competition at any time prior to entering into a formal agreement.

□ Kaleida Health reserves the right to reasonably request additional information or clarification of information provided in the submission without changing the terms of the invitation.

□ Kaleida Health reserves the right to waive any technicalities or irregularities in any proposal.

Figure 11. An artist’s rendering of the hospital complex looking southeast along Chapin Parkway (Hiroaki Hata).
□ Respondent firms/teams acknowledge and agree that Kaleida Health or any other entity affiliated with Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital will not be liable for any costs, expenses, losses, damages (including damages for loss of anticipated profit) or liabilities incurred as a result of, or arising out of, submitting a response, negotiating changes to such response, or due to Kaleida Health’s acceptance or non-acceptance of the proposal.

□ kaleida health shall determine at its sole discretion and provide the release of all public information concerning the competition, including selection announcements and prize awards. Those desiring to release information associated with this competition to the public must receive prior written approval from an authorized representative of Kaleida Health.

□ Neither Kaleida Health, Millard Fillmore Gates Circle Hospital, the University at Buffalo Urban Design Project, nor the Urban Land Institute nor any of their officers, agents, consultants, or employees shall be responsible for the accuracy of any information provided as part of this invitation. All respondents are encouraged to independently verify the accuracy of any information provided. The use of any of this information in the preparation of a competition submission is at the sole risk of the respondent.

□ Respondents shall not collude in any manner or engage in any practices with any other respondent(s) that may restrict or eliminate competition or otherwise restrain trade. Violation of this instruction will cause Kaleida Health to reject the respondent’s submittal. This prohibition is not intended to preclude joint ventures or collaborations.

□ All submissions must be the original work product of the respondent. The copying, paraphrasing, or other use of substantial portions of the work product of another respondent is not permitted unless legally enforceable permission has been secured from that other party. Failure to adhere to this instruction will cause Kaleida Health to reject the submission.

□ Respondents, team members and its consultants are prohibited from communicating in any manner about this project with any of the members of the Kaleida Health management, staff, board of directors or the competition jury during this process. All questions during the review period should be submitted by e-mail to Bradshaw Hovey at bhovey@buffalo.edu. Failure to adhere to this rule may result in the disqualification of the competitor.

Figure 12. The medical services building (right) is the newest element of the complex, enclosing about a quarter million square feet.